

From: allison
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 06/26/2009 08:53 AM
Subject: REQUEST for PUBLIC HEARING ON LAHAINA WASTEWATER INJECTION WELL PERMIT

I oppose the granting of the permit unless additional conditions are placed on the permit as set forth in the letter of the DIRE Coalition to EPA. While they have identified a range of issues and concerns to which EPA has not spoken previously or which they have newly identified, they have not provided you with anywhere near all the supporting data in their letter. They are in the process of gathering these data (and preparing their presentation) and will provide them to you at the public hearing we are requesting.

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 02:48 PM
From: damonseed
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 06/26/2009 11:29 AM
Subject: Injection well response

REQUEST for PUBLIC HEARING ON LAHAINA WASTEWATER INJECTION WELL PERMIT

I oppose the granting of the permit unless additional conditions are placed on the permit as set forth in the letter of the DIRE Coalition to EPA. While they have identified a range of issues and concerns to which EPA has not spoken previously or which they have newly identified, they have not provided you with anywhere near all the supporting data in their letter. They are in the process of gathering these data (and preparing their presentation) and will provide them to you at the public hearing we are requesting.

We the community should be allowed to decide whether we want injection wells which are disasterous to our groundwater
Mahalo
Damon Parrillo

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 02:48 PM
From: damonseed
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 06/26/2009 11:32 AM
Subject: Re: Injection well response

-----Original Message

>From: damonseed

>Sent: Jun 26, 2009 8:31 AM

>To: damonseed

>Subject: Re: Injection well response

>

>

>I also would like to ask for a public hearing on injection wells in Lahaina

>mahalo

>Wainani Kealoha

>-----Original Message

>>From: damonseed

>>Sent: Jun 26, 2009 8:29 AM

>>To: rumrill.nancy@epamail.epa.gov

>>Subject: Injection well response

>>

>>REQUEST for PUBLIC HEARING ON LAHAINA WASTEWATER INJECTION WELL PERMIT

>>

>>I oppose the granting of the permit unless additional conditions are placed on the permit as set forth in the letter of the DIRE Coalition to EPA. While they have identified a range of issues and concerns to which EPA has not spoken previously or which they have newly identified, they have not provided you with anywhere near all the supporting data in their letter. They are in the process of gathering these data (and preparing their presentation) and will provide them to you at the public hearing we are requesting.

>>

>>We the community should be allowed to decide whether we want injection wells which are disasterous to our groundwater

>>Mahalo

>>Damon Parrillo

>

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 02:48 PM

From: JILL LAFFIN

To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA

Date: 06/29/2009 10:25 AM

Subject: Maui Injection Wells

Aloha Nancy,

I hope you have choosen to listen to the people who live on Maui and hold another public meeting about our injection well nightmare!!!!!!!!!!!!

I spoke at your last meeting. I had lived on Maui for 22 years and have recently relocated to Molokaibecause I can no longer witness of the abuse and negelect of West Maui by the County, the State and the UNITED STATES OF AMERICA.

EPA does not stand for :Effects of Political Agenda

Please do your job as an officer of the EPA. An entity created to protect our land ,air, and water. NOT THE POCKETS OF ELECTED OFFICIALS

Thank you for doing the right thing for West Maui and this little piece of our planet Earth
Mahalo,
Jill Laffin

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 02:48 PM
From: SAMANTHA GEORGE
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 07/05/2009 05:46 AM
Subject: Lahaina injection well

Title: REQUEST for PUBLIC HEARING ON LAHAINA WASTEWATER INJECTION WELL PERMIT

I oppose the granting of the permit unless additional conditions are placed on the permit as set forth in the letter of the DIRE Coalition to EPA. While they have identified a range of issues and concerns to which EPA has not spoken previously or which they have newly identified, they have not provided you with anywhere near all the supporting data in their letter. They are in the process of gathering these data (and preparing their presentation) and will provide them to you at the public hearing we are requesting.

Thank You,
samantha george

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 02:48 PM
From: Brooke Porter
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/06/2009 02:37 PM
Subject: Lahaina Wastewater injection Permit

Aloha e Ms. Rumrill,

Speaking on behalf of the Pacific Whale Foundation, a Maui-based nonprofit dedicated to marine conservation, research and education, I am writing to inform you of our opposition to the granting of the proposed 10 year permit for the Lahaina Wastewater Facility. There is increasing scientific evidence that supports the overwhelming

anecdotal evidence of the negative impacts to the coral reef ecosystem associated with injection wells and resulting plumes. We are asking that the EPA please limit the permit to the time necessary to put in place adequate treatment and replace the dated systems with new systems for the purposes of water reclamation to recycle the wastewater for reuse on land.

Mahalo,

--

Brooke Porter, MEd
Director of Conservation

Pacific Whale Foundation
300 Ma'alaea Road
Suite 211
Wailuku, Hawai'i 96793
Work (808) 856-8341
Fax (808) 243-9021

<www.pacificwhale.org>

Please consider the environment before printing this email

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Michael Dollinger" <Mike
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/07/2009 11:44 AM
Subject: FW: The "smell" of West Maui

I am not an engineer just a homeowner in West Maui. Unfortunately I cannot be at the meeting, but let me tell you something is wrong. On many nights when the Kaanapali Golf Course waters their grass with recycled water, it smells like a sewer around here. Windows cannot be opened, and the sulphur-like smell permeates our home. Frankly it's awful, and we can't believe it's safe to breath. They "claim" they don't have the money to fix the problem. Hopefully you can force them or in the alternative President Obama's health care plan will come to the rescue because we, living here, may need it.

From: wmta
Sent: Fri 8/7/2009 1:27 AM
To: Michael Dollinger
Subject: Re: The "smell" of West Maui

Aloha Michael,
The WMTA is aware of this issue and is discussing possible options to present to the Administration to help address this situation. We thank you for taking the time to write us and do hope you can attend the upcoming meeting in Lahaina regarding this issue. Attached below is the information on that meeting, Malama Pono Ame Mahalo, zeke kalua

NOTICE OF PUBLIC MEETING AND HEARING CONCERNING
>THE DRAFT UNDERGROUND INJECTION CONTROL (UIC) PERMIT
>FOR THE LAHAINA WASTEWATER RECLAMATION FACILITY
>
>Comment period extended through August 20, 2009
>
>PUBLIC MEETING AND HEARING
>
>The U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) will hold an informational
>public meeting and a public hearing on August 20, 2009 concerning the draft
>Underground Injection Control (UIC) permit for the Lahaina Wastewater
>Reclamation Facility (LWRF). The public meeting and hearing will be held
>at:
>
> Lahaina Civic Center
> Social Hall Meeting Area
> 1840 Honoapiilani Hwy
> Lahaina, Maui, HI 96761
>
>The public meeting is scheduled from 4:30 pm to 6:00 pm. The purpose of the
>meeting is to allow EPA to explain the terms and conditions of the draft
>permit, and give interested parties an opportunity to ask the EPA questions
>regarding the permit. Representatives from the County of Maui and the
>Hawai'i Department of Health will also attend the meeting.

>
>After the meeting, the public hearing will begin at 7:00 pm and end at 9:00
>pm. EPA invites interested persons to attend the hearing and provide the
>Agency with comments and recommendations on the draft UIC permit for the
>County of Maui's LWRF. The purpose of the hearing is for the public to
>submit oral or written statements and data concerning the draft permit. The
>proceedings of the hearing will be recorded by a court reporter. We request
>that oral comments provided during the public hearing be limited to five (5)
>minutes per person; this limit may be extended if time allows.

>
>Persons who are physically disabled and require special accommodation to
>participate in the public meeting or hearing should contact Dean Higuchi in
>EPA's Honolulu office at (808) 541-2710, no later than August 6, 2009.

>
>EPA issued the public notice for the revised draft UIC permit on May 24,
>2009. The public comment period was scheduled to close on June 23, 2009.
> However, the public comment period is hereby extended to the close of the
>public hearing on August 20, 2009.

>
>Written comments on the draft permit must be received or postmarked no later
>than August 20, 2009 to be considered. You can send written comments to
>U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Ground Water Office (WTR-9), 75
>Hawthorne Street, San Francisco, CA 94105, Attn: Nancy Rumrill, phone (415)
>972-3293, fax (415) 947-3549, or via e-mail at rumrill.nancy@epa.gov. As
>noted, written comments may also be provided to EPA at the public hearing.

>
>**BACKGROUND**

>
>The County of Maui owns and operates the Lahaina Wastewater Reclamation
>Facility located at 3300 Honoapiilani Highway, Lahaina, Hawaii. The LWRF
>treats approximately 4 to 6 million gallons per day (mgd) of wastewater
>through secondary treatment. Treatment of the wastewater includes processes
>to settle out the sludge and to remove dissolved organic matter and residual
>suspended matter. The LWRF further disinfects approximately 1 mgd of
>>wastewater by ultraviolet light to be reused by customers for irrigation
>purposes. Approximately 3 to 5 mgd of the treated effluent is gravity fed
>into the four (4) Class V injection wells.

>
>EPA has made a preliminary determination that the injection of treated
>>wastewater allowed under the revised draft permit is protective of
>underground sources of drinking water, as required by the Safe Drinking
>Water Act. The draft permit contains new requirements for biochemical
>oxygen demand and suspended solids that are the same as the conditions
>imposed by the State of Hawai'i Department of Health (DOH), a reduction in
>the injection volumetric rate limits and a nitrate concentration limit. The
>draft permit also imposes new mass loading limits for total nitrogen, which
>become more stringent over the course of the 10-year permit term, and a
>requirement for the injection fluid to be treated to the same level as the
>reuse waste water by a future compliance date. To ensure the County
>complies with the new conditions, the draft permit requires additional
>monitoring and reporting.

>
>EPA has made a preliminary determination to approve the draft Class V UIC
>permit as provided by Part C of the Safe Drinking Water Act, as amended, and

>by UIC regulations in Title 40 of the Code of Federal Regulations (CFR)
>Parts 124, 144, and 146.

>
>DOCUMENTS

>
>Copies of the draft permit, the Statement of Basis, this public notice, and
>the County of Maui's application are available for review at:

>
>Lahaina Public Library
>680 Wharf Street
>Lahaina, Hawaii
>(808) 662-3950

>
>These documents are also available on EPA's Region 9 web page at:

>
><http://www.epa.gov/region09/water/groundwater/uic-permits.html>

>
>Copies of EPA's documents and the County of Maui's application can also be
>obtained by contacting: U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Ground Water
>Office (WTR-9)
>75 Hawthorne Street, San Francisco, CA 94105, Attn: Nancy Rumrill; phone
>(415) 972-3293; fax (415) 947-3549; or via e-mail at rumrill.nancy@epa.gov.

>
>
>The EPA San Francisco office also has the administrative record for the
>proposed permit available for public inspection from 8:30 am to 5:00 pm,
>Monday through Friday. All data submitted by the applicant is available as
>part of the administrative record.

>
>FINAL PERMIT DECISION AND APPEALS PROCESS

>
>EPA will make a final decision regarding the draft UIC permit after all
>comments and recommendations have been considered. EPA will send a response
>to comments from the current and the prior public comment period and a
>notice of our final decision to each person who submitted comments,
>including testimony at any hearing, or requested such notice. Within thirty
>(30) days after the final permit decision has been issued, any person who
>filed comments on the draft permit, participated in the public hearings on
>this matter, or takes issue with any changes in the draft permit, may
>petition the Environmental Appeals Board to review any condition of the
>permit decision. Commenters are referred to 40 CFR Section 124.19 for
>procedural requirements of the appeal process.

>
>-----

>Nancy Rumrill
>U.S. Environmental Protection Agency, Region 9
>Ground Water Office, WTR-9
>75 Hawthorne Street
>San Francisco, CA 94105
>415-972-3293
>415-947-3545 (FAX)

>No virus found in this incoming message.

>Checked by AVG - www.avg.com

>Version: 8.5.392 / Virus Database: 270.13.18/2243 - Release Date: 07/17/09

>06:08:00

>

--- Mike

From: "Michael Dollinger" <Mike

To: <wmta

Subject: The "smell" of West Maui

Date: Thu, 6 Aug 2009 12:57:51 -0700

Now that a hospital is in site, thanks to your efforts, it might be time to address the smell of West Maui which permeates the Kaanapali area at night due to the pumping station problems (according to Steve at the Water Recycle Plant). Evidently they are not planning to fix the problem of the awful sulphur/sewer smell at night for several years due to budget problems. At times it is not pleasant to live here to say the least. I understand you have been in contact with Water Company officials about the problem, and I want to assure you there is a problem. Hopefully patients in the hospital won't have to suffer from it as well! I appreciate whatever you can do. Mike Dollinger

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----

From: "Howard Hanzawa" <Howard

To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA

Date: 08/19/2009 02:16 PM

Subject: Draft UIC Permit for the Lahaina Wastewater Treatment Plant

Dear Ms. Rumrill:

I am submitting via the attached my testimony for tomorrow's hearing on the UIC permit for the Lahaina Wastewater Treatment Plant.

Thank you, Howard Hanzawa

Howard Hanzawa, P.E., Vice President
Kaanapali Land Management Corporation
275 Lahainaluna Road
Lahaina, Hawaii 96761
Office (808) 661-9652
FAX (808) 667-9658
Email: Howard
Website: www.KaanapaliLand.com

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----

From: "Maury King" <maury
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/19/2009 03:43 PM
Subject: Injection well Testimony

Thanks for agreeing to come and listen and share about injection wells with the Maui Community. I hope to have a chance to introduce myself to you at the hearing, but here is a letter from me in today's Maui News. Please consider it as testimony.

Maui News Letter to Editor 8/19:

It's proven: Injection wells harm reefs
POSTED: August 19, 2009

Cheryl Okuma (Viewpoint, Aug. 16) states there isn't any scientific evidence of problems with injection wells. I beg to differ.

Recent findings by Meghan Dailer of the UH Botany Department have shown a presence of invasive algae blooms in the vicinity of injection wells. These algae have incorporated into their tissue ¹⁵N nitrogen signals which indicate the presence of human sewage waste.

This is the first scientific evidence of damage to the reefs caused by wastewater pumped into injection wells. It is a significant finding and one that should not be taken lightly.

Russell Sparks, the education specialist for the Division of Aquatic Resources, Department of Land and Natural Resources, echoes these findings in his talk on "Maui's Coral Reefs in Danger - the Slippery Slope to Slime."

Injection well permits are slated for another 10-year renewal period. If they do add to the desecration of reefs, what would be left after 10 more years? I was under the impression that everyone from the mayor to the tree huggers are in favor of phasing out these wells and finding better uses for the millions of gallons a day being poured down the drain.

The EPA has generously offered a second meeting to hear about this issue. They will be at Lahaina Civic Center Thursday starting at 4:30 with an informational exchange and formal testimony from the public starting at 7 p.m. Please be there so your voice can be heard.

Maury King
Kihei

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Jeffrey H. Schwartz" <Jeff
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/19/2009 07:39 PM
Subject: DIRE Coalition Testimony for 8/20 Lahaina Hearing

Hi Nancy,

Welcome to Maui. Aloha and E komo mai!

Attached find the final testimony and more detailed written submission for the record of tomorrow night's EPA hearing on the Lahaina injection well permit.

Please include this in the record.

I look forward to seeing you again tomorrow evening.

Jeff

Jeff Schwartz
for the DIRE Coalition
Don't Inject, RE-direct, because the situation's dire . . .
<http://dontinject.org>

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: Darla J White <onareef>
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 11:48 AM
Subject: Testimony for the Lahaina UIC Permit renewal

Darla J. White
Marine Research / Scientific Diver
755 Kupulau Dr., Kihei, HI 96753-9349 Cell: (808) 345-2312
E-mail: onareef

OBJECTIVE: To further our understanding of the marine environment through research and education in order to promote conservation and longevity of these ecosystems.

August 19, 2009

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency,
Ground Water Office (WTR-9)
75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, CA 94105
Attn: Nancy Rumrill
rumrill.nancy@epa.gov

Aloha Ms. Rumrill:

My name is Darla White and I am testifying on behalf of myself this evening. I have been a coral reef research diver here in Hawai'i for nearly a decade. I currently work for the Division of Aquatic Resources here on Maui, and collaboratively with the University of Hawai'i's Botany group to conduct research on the reef at Kahekili.

I know I speak on the behalf of the greater island community when I say 'mahalo' for the time and attention that the EPA has given to the revision efforts of the Lahaina UIC permit.[L1] There has been substantial positive progress toward

incorporating the concerns of the Maui community, and I sincerely thank you. However there is a lot more that can be accomplished and I hope that the EPA and the County will commit to a plan to move forward towards reduced wastewater injection, reduced nitrogen, disinfection of the injectate, advanced treatment, and increased water reuse under the revised permit.

The reef at Kahekili is in trouble as you may well know by now. It has been declining at an incredible rate, and a lot of time and money and manpower have been dedicated to try to understand what is going on and to implement measures to save it. University and State researchers have spent an inordinate amount of effort to collect data and understand the complexities of the reef's deterioration, and they have done a GREAT job in furthering our knowledge of the impacts there. In addition to the new Kahekili Herbivore Fisheries Management Rule that was designed to help reduce the algal threats and recently signed into law by the Governor, the Hawai'i Coral Program under the US Coral Reef Task Force has identified Kahekili as the number one priority site in the Main Hawaiian Islands. Scientists from NOAA and Scripps are starting to come here to design and implement new research strategies because this area is so incredibly important. This ecosystem is in peril, and any successful recovery will depend on the efforts to remove the impacts of land based pollution, a major component of which has been identified as wastewater intrusion.

One of my primary concerns is the antibiotic resistant pathogens, endocrine disrupters, and toxic and hazardous compounds found in wastewater. I would like to see the UIC permit address this issue for the health of the public and the nearshore environment. The levels of toxins (and even nitrogen) in the environment, even at acceptable levels for people, can be deleterious to more sensitive organisms, such as corals. Several coral diseases to date have been linked to land based pollution. I personally have also had MRSA several times, three confirmed by hospitals, including one minor surgery. Public health and safety is a very important issue here, and so is the health of marine organisms. Testing needs to be done and treatment needs to be consistent with potential health threats. We know enough to take action and enact better requirements. The Clean Water Act is applicable here. I want fishable swimmable waters that support my personal health and the health of the coral reef ecosystem. I would also like to ask for accountability for environmental monitoring as an aspect of the permit, for injectate as well as reuse. This could come in several forms, such as working collaboratively with State, Federal, or University institutions. The fate and transport of the pollution (including nutrients, pathogens, and toxins) needs to be monitored and accounted for. The burden of proof should not be on the scientific community to define causal connections when an ecosystem is headed toward collapse; it should be on the polluter to demonstrate where it is going and that it is not causing a problem. Again, monitoring is needed for reuse as well as injectate.

There is much too much to cover so I would like to state my emphatic support for the testimonies provided this evening and in writing by the Hawai'i DLNR Division of Aquatic Resources, the DIRE Coalition, Robin Knox, Meghan Dailer, and Liz Foote.

I would also like to thank Mayor Tavares for her willingness to commit to reuse of this important resource. I know that this is an achievable goal, and with the political will it will succeed.

Thank you again for your time and the opportunity to give public input.

Best regards,

Darla White

Darla J White
Special Projects Coordinator
Hawai'i DLNR Division of Aquatic Resources, Maui
130 Mahalani Street, Wailuku HI 96793

Eyes of the Reef
Climate Change, Marine Disease, & Invasive Species Local Action Strategy
Island Coordinator, Maui
www.reefcheckhawaii.org/eyesofthereef.htm

Cell: 808-345-2312; Fax 888-570-2641
onareef
darla.j.white

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Jeffrey H. Schwartz" <Jeff
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 11:53 AM
Subject: Please Replace Final DIRE Coalition Testimony With Attached

Nancy,

Attached you fill the final DIRE Coalition testimony. It revises the testimony
I
sent yesterday in light of the subsequent communications to us from the Mayor.

Please substitute this attachment as our testimony for tonight's public hearing
in Lahaina.

Many thanks,
Jeff Schwartz
DIRE Coalition
878-1314

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: Tony Povilitis <a_povilitis
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 12:12 PM
Subject: Lahaina Permit

Dear Ms. Rumrill;

Please find attached our comments in connection with today's hearing in Lahaina.
Be sure to include the attached in the public record of comments on this matter.

Thank you.

Tony Povilitis, PhD

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Jonia Mariechild" <jonia7
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 01:54 PM
Subject: Save Honolua Coalition

Dear Ms. Rumrill,

Thank you for the work that you do to protect our environment.

I am writing to testify that I agree with DIRE'S testimony. Please follow the following link to view a copy of the testimony.

<http://www.savehonolua.org/blog/?p=112>

Thank you,
Jonia Mariechild
Maui Resident

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: Lucienne DeNaie <laluz
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 02:09 PM
Subject: Comments on Draft UIC Lahaina Wastewater & Reclamation Plant

Pleased find attached Sierra Club Maui Group comments on the Lahaina Wastewater Treatment Plant UIC permit.

Mahalo

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Kim Thompson" <kimt-maui
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 03:17 PM
Subject: Comments: Underground Injection Control (UIC) permit for Lahaina Wastewater Reclamation Facility (LWRF)

Comments: Underground Injection Control (UIC) permit for Lahaina Wastewater Reclamation Facility (LWRF)

We are opposed to continuing the permit allowing any pumping of treated

wastewater into injections wells around Maui.

This is wasting water, a very scarce resource on the island. This treated water should ALL be used for irrigation as it has been successfully used in some locations on the island. This will leave more water to maintain the aquifers which will provide future water for Maui.

The treated wastewater from injection wells has been scientifically shown to cause harm to the reef ecosystems surrounding the island. These reef ecosystems are vital to the economic health of the islands, providing much of the draw for tourism, our biggest industry. Healthy reef ecosystems are also vital to the preservation of Hawaiian culture and lifestyle here.

The investment in building irrigation pipes will decrease the investment needed to develop additional water sources.

Kim and Karen Thompson
1450 S Kihei Rd Apt C-108
Kihei, HI 96753
kimt-maui

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: Christina Hemming <christina
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 04:05 PM
Subject: no to HOnlua injection wells

Please do not continue to pollute our waters. No injection wells at Honloua, Hawaii.
Christina Hemming

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Rene Umberger" <octopus
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 04:22 PM
Subject: Aug. 20 Lahaina Injection Well Permit Testimony

Aloha Ms. Rumrill,

Attached is testimony from the Maui Nui Marine Resource Council.

Looking forward to a productive meeting this afternoon!

Mahalo!

Rene Umberger
Administrator

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Robin Knox" <wqcinc
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA, Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 04:35 PM
Subject: Comments on Lahaina UIC Permit ni. HI50710003

Aloha Ms. Rumrill
Attached are my second set of comments on the referenced revised draft permit.
Please include these in the record of decision for this permit. I look forward
to seeing you at the hearing this evening. Mahalo Nui Loa for your hard work on
this permit.
Respectfully – Robin S. Knox
(808)281-6416

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Rene Umberger" <octopus
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 04:45 PM
Subject: Aug. 20 Lahaina Injection Well Permit Hearing Testimony

Aloha Ms. Rumrill,

Attached is testimony on the proposed Lahaina Injection Well permit, presented
by the Maui Reef Fund.

Mahalo,
Rene Umberger
Board Member

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: Diana Dahl <melofarm
To: E-mail:
Date: 08/20/2009 05:36 PM
Subject: OCM Testimony re: Injection Wells

'OHANA COALITION MAUI
P. O. Box
739 - Makawao, HI 96768
(808) 573-3676 - www.ohanacoalition.org

"A Platform Based on Community
Values"

Aug 19, 2009

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency -
Ground Water Office (WTR-9)
75 Hawthorne Street, San Francisco, CA 94105
Attn: Nancy Rumrill
Fax (415) 947-3549
E-mail: rumrill.nancy@epa.gov.

Re: COMMENTS ON DRAFT UNDERGROUND INJECTION CONTROL (UIC) PERMIT
FOR THE
LAHAINA WASTEWATER RECLAMATION FACILITY

Dear Ms. Rumrill,

'Ohana Coalition welcomes the EPA to Maui! We deeply appreciate your coming to explain the terms and conditions of the draft UIC permit and to consider community input on the issue.

The 'Ohana Coalition Maui (OCM) is a political action committee formed in 2002 by citizens of Maui County to serve the best interests of the people and the 'aina. Since then we have been active in each election raising public awareness on issues, promoting candidates who meet our criteria, and reaching thousands of voters.

Our mission is to "support the election of ethical government representatives who are committed to protecting the culture and the environment, and promoting sustainability, social justice, education and island style small-town living for Maui. The Coalition also communicates with elected officials about relevant community issues."

The issue of injection wells was featured in our discussions with candidates in the last election.

We asked them where they stood on the issue of transitioning from injection well disposal to re-use of treated reclaimed water. This is matter of great concern to our group, and an issue our community also cares about.

At present, it is our understanding that one committee chair of the Maui County Council is drafting legislation to submit to the whole council which would phase out injection wells for all Maui County public wastewater treatment facilities. Also, Mayor Tavares announced in May her goal of 100 percent phase-out of injection wells and recycling of reclaimed water in Maui wastewater plants. Although the mayor is not committed to ending injection wells in 5 years, but only to having a plan by that time, we do support her intention. Nevertheless, we need an expedited timetable. Five years for a plan seems way too long.

Definitely, a five year term is warranted to ensure that progress is made and that the situation is revisited more than once a decade or longer. However, if it is not feasible to end injection practices in five years then the OC would ask for reductions in nitrogen loading and injectate

rates during that five years toward the ultimate goal of eliminating underground injection as a disposal option. Every small amount of reuse - or better - removal of nitrogen with existing treatment can help. There are improvements short of complete reuse that would significantly reduce nitrogen loads to the reef within five years.

According to experts, every day that goes by another 215 pounds of nitrogen goes onto the reef and another 3 million gallons of freshwater is wasted that could instead be flowing in Maui's streams. Every year in a compliance schedule is another 78,475 lbs of nitrogen on the reef and 1221 million gallons (more than 1.2 billion gallons a year). One asks how many more pounds do we want to allow?

Clearly then, the 10 year permit suggested in the Draft UIC, with no specific goal or timetable to phase out injection wells, will not be effective in dealing with the present impacts injection wells cause to public health and marine ecosystems. Fortunately, there appears to be political will building to mitigate as soon as possible the effects of this destructive practice.

Therefore, OCM supports the EPA setting permit conditions with detailed provisions for a viable injection well phase-out plan and specific goals and benchmarks that need to be met to help make this goal a reality.

Moreover, throughout the phase-out period, OCM supports reduction of nitrogen and phosphorus levels and thorough disinfection of pathogens in any wastewater that is injected in this interim period.

Finally, OCM wants to see a strong water quality, monitoring plan with information accessible to the public as part of the permit conditions.

With regard to funding, more and more housing and commercial development is being proposed for West Maui, and most of it will depend on the present treatment facility. The County should have a plan in place to use these new user fees to help fund a transition to a cleaner and more efficient use of our treated effluent, and leave injection wells behind.

Mahalo for coming to Maui and giving us the opportunity to speak on behalf of the future of our reefs and ocean life.

Sincerely,

The 'Ohana Coalition Maui Steering Committee

Lucienne DeNaie - Chairman Pro Tem Shannon Guillermo
John Naylor - Vice Chair Rich Lucas
Diana Dahl - Treasurer/Corresponding Sec. Mike McCormick
Cathy McDuff - Secretary Nadine Newlight
Hannah Bernard Maggie Welker

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Irene Bowie" <huladog1
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 05:43 PM
Subject: testimony from Maui Tomorrow on Lahaina Wastewater Treatment UIC permit

Aloha Nancy,
Please find attached to this message testimony from Maui Tomorrow Foundation, Inc. on the permit for Lahaina Wastewater Treatment facility. I'll also be presenting this testimony at tonight's meeting in Lahaina.
Mahalo,
Irene

Irene Bowie
Executive Director
Maui Tomorrow Foundation, Inc.
55 Church Street, Suite A-5
Wailuku, HI 96793
Phone: 808-244-7570

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: Ashley Justice <ashley
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 07:33 PM
Subject: RE: Public Comments on Lahaina, HI WWRF UIC Permit Number HI50710003

August 20, 2009

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Ground Water Office (WTR-9)
75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, CA 94105
ATTN: Nancy Rumrill
RE: Public Comments on Lahaina, HI WWRF UIC Permit Number HI50710003

Dear Ms. Rumrill:

Thank you for the opportunity to comment on the revised permit to inject wastewater from the Lahaina Wastewater Reclamation facility. I am providing comments and discussion on behalf of the Pacific Whale Foundation, a Maui-based non-profit organization dedicated to marine conservation, education and research.

Though we recognize the improvements made to the revised permit, we remain in opposition of the permit application to continue injecting nitrogen-laden wastewaters into the near-shore environment off Lahaina due to reasons discussed in this letter.

We request that the proposed 10 year permit be shortened to a maximum of 5 years during which time, the injection of wastewater is phased out and replaced with safe, on land re-use of nutrient rich, treated wastewater on land. We also ask that appropriate and attainable benchmarks be included in the permit to achieve these goals.

Hawaii's reefs generate millions of dollars in revenue annually for the state. It could be argued that they are Hawaii's most valuable assets. The anthropogenic factors that continue to degrade the reefs threaten to impact the lucrative tourism industry and our local ways of life. Though not the only contributing factor to coral loss, it is our civic duty to address and consider any possible threat to the reef.

Injection wells are rendered ineffective due to the hydraulic conductivity coupled with differences in salinities result in a leaching of effluent into surrounding aquifers and coastal waters causing a nutrient-rich, buoyant plume that displaces other shoreward flowing ground water.

As stated in previous testimony, given on November 6, 2008, Maui County has failed to bear the necessary burden of proof required by the permit application that the continued injection of wastewater will not result in harm coral reefs, impair commerce and tourism and will be of greater benefit the citizens when compared to on land re-use of wastewater.

Working to protect and conserve the marine resources, Pacific Whale Foundation asks that a critical approach be taken and that "water reuse is recognized as an environmentally preferred method of disposing treated wastewater (effluent), when compared to the traditional disposal methods through outfalls and injection wells,² as stated in the 2004 Hawaii Water Reuse Survey and Report prepared for Hawaii DNLR, • Final Draft, (2005), p. 7, and that the permit be further revised to include the aforementioned requests.

The available information and evidence demonstrates the dire threat that wastewater injection wells pose to near shore waters and coral reefs and we ask that the proposed, revised permit application be denied and ask the EPA to shorten the permit length and add additional benchmarks to ensure the dated method of injection wells will be replaced with safe, on land re-use of treated wastewater.

Sincerely,
Ashley Justice
Conservation Coordinator
Pacific Whale Foundation

300 Maalaea Road, Suite 211
Wailuku, HI 96793
www.pacificwhale.org

References:

Hawaii DNLR. 2005. 2004 Hawaii Water Reuse Survey and Report •p. 7.

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: Alastair Hebard <alastair_hebard
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 08:07 PM
Subject: Alastair Hebard's comment on Lahaina Wastewater Reclamation Facility
(LWRF)(Permit # HI50710003)

Attached is my comment as a PDF file,

Thanks,
Alastair Hebard

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Surfrider Foundation Maui Chapter" <maui.surfrider
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/20/2009 08:36 PM
Subject: EPA testimony from Surfrider Maui

Aloha Ms. Rumrill
Sorry to be too ill to attend the hearing tonight. Please accept the attached
written testimony
Jan Roberson

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Teri Leonard" <teri
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/21/2009 01:25 AM
Subject: EPA Lahaina UIC permit testimony

Aloha Ms. Rumrill,

Attached is my testimony which you requested that I email to you. Thank you
again for coming to Maui to revisit this important issue. Please consider the
Clean Water Act as you make your final decisions. We are fighting for our lives
here.

Mahalo,

Teri Leonard

Teri Leonard
SMS Reef Sustainability Chairperson
teri
SouthMauiSustainability.org
808-268-2628

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Maury King" <maury
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA, <chauncey.hew
Date: 08/21/2009 02:54 PM
Subject: Injection Reflections

aloha Nancy and Chauncey -

I just wanted to thank you and David, Brent and Wendy for giving us your time and the courtesy and respect of hearing us out. (I don't have your EPA partners contact info and you can feel free to pass this along verbally or via email) Especially the back and forth of the afternoon where we actually had a chance to learn about what your jobs really are limited to. (sorry we can't ask your help in treating our wastewater, but now understand why)

I hope you could really hear how much people love and are afraid of the loss of their reefs. I'm sure you understand from what you heard that people thought you were here to help us save the reefs. I'm sure most don't understand that you only regulate the drinking water side of the issue. (too bad Clean Water staff weren't there as well) I heard from you how semantic distinctions of what type of water we're talking about and who is in control of surface or ground water could cause this to fall between the cracks of 2 parts of the same agency, and throw in the State Dept of Health just to add another layer of complexity and fall through the crackability (made that one up). That just doesn't sound right and makes me scratch my head and hope you are scratching yours as well about the silliness, ineffectiveness, and even absurdity of that situation. (I'm thinkin' Bill Clinton saying "depends on what your definition of is is")

To call up my own words from the afternoon session, due to the definition of how water has to travel directly or indirectly from source to sea to determine who is in charge of regulating it, we've made Mother Earth herself the pawn or dupe in the semantic game as the water that passes through her doesn't qualify because she isn't a pipe. I don't think she'd be happy to see herself being made insignificant because her 'direct flow' has no sharp edges on it as a pipe would. Let's get real about this way of defining things.

As I stated in my evening testimony, I hope the Drinking Water people can encourage participation of the Clean Water people and freely acknowledge the connection between the wells and the degradation of the reefs (at least as one of the causes). Let's not go kicking and screaming to protecting the

environment, let's work together and you can leave us feeling that your agency really did protect us in a meaningful way with teeth, and help nudge us toward phasing out injection wells as quickly as possible. (if you see a haggard guy outside your SF office with a tin cup and a cardboard sign saying "please help Maui buy \$30 million dollars worth of UV filters and pipe for R1 delivery" feel free to drop in a huge check)

I am very concerned that on top of her wonderful support of phasing out injection wells, Mayor Tavares sabotages it by asking for no reduction in nitrogen with the new permit because we can use it to grow algae for fuel. This is such a far in the future unproven idea that it doesn't make any sense to plan for that happening by allowing continued reef degradation while we are figuring things out. I'm sure we can find a way to get plenny nitrogen back when we actually have a proven, safe use for it in our energy production mix. Please consider this in the conditions of the new permit.

Lastly, we discussed the leachates from the landfill that are delivered to the wastewater plant and tossed into the process. I request that you put in a condition prohibiting that practice. It has to be much easier and wiser to redistribute those leachates by putting them back on the top of the landfill than taking a chance on what they are adding to the stew coming out the tailpipe of the treatment plant and heading for injection. Damn, I hope that falls within your purview.

With everything we've learned about our planet and the resources we've plundered and squandered and used in unwise and dangerous ways causing harm to our environment and all of its inhabitants with little thought for the future, the time is right for boldness and action to make things right. You couldn't ask for a better boss than Barack to set you up for that kind of shift. You wouldn't be working where you do if you didn't care about the environment. Please step up.

Yes, I guess this is intended as more testimony and please consider it as such.

Maury King
3500 A Kehala Dr.
Kihei, HI 96753

808-874-5955

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: Liz Foote <lfoote
To: tmcdadecsr
Date: 08/25/2009 01:19 PM
Subject: EPA Testimony

Aloha,

I am sorry for the delay in emailing this; I got sick over the weekend. My testimony is below.

-Liz

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency,
Ground Water Office (WTR-9)
75 Hawthorne Street
San Francisco, CA 94105
Attn: Nancy Rumrill
rumrill.nancy@epa.gov

August 20, 2009

Thank you for the chance to provide my testimony. I'm Liz Foote, and I am testifying as an individual, though I do serve as the Hawaii Field Manager for the Coral Reef Alliance, and as the Executive Director of Project S.E.A.-Link. I would like to state that I support the testimonies of the DIRE Coalition and the Hawaii DLNR Division of Aquatic Resources which address many of the details that have been brought up here today by others, so I will not waste time repeating those now.

However I do want to take this opportunity to make a few general comments that I feel are necessary in these deliberations.

First, I recognize that this is a complex issue and that there are a lot of factors involved, such as feasibility and cost. However I think that the science as well as the local community have demonstrated that the issue of injection wells and wastewater treatment needs to be addressed sooner rather than later. The main thing I'd like to speak about today involves the nature of science, and its role in informing political action.

When we say that management decisions need to be based on the "best available science," that has a lot of implications. What it should not imply is that a particular question must be "proved" in order to justify a particular decision. The reality is that nothing can ever "proved" through scientific processes... scientists can only "fail to disprove" something. And in doing so, methodology is constantly refined and improved, and supporting evidence is gathered so that a more thorough understanding can be achieved.

It's also important to note that marine ecological processes are complicated and dynamic, and it is often difficult to develop effective methodologies to conduct the sampling necessary for question-driven research. Many interrelated factors may be at work, and are difficult to tease apart due to all sorts of constraints and confounding factors. Science is an adaptive process that is constantly refining itself.

In addition, an absence of studies and significant data doesn't necessarily imply the absence of a particular condition; it may only indicate that studies may not have even been conducted, or that they are still "in process." Research activities and peer-reviewed results are themselves constrained by funding, agency priorities, researcher availability, technology, and so forth.

A key responsibility of science is to inform the rulemaking process, but the presence or absence of data should not be the sole determinant factor.

In this case, I do believe we HAVE seen compelling evidence from the University of Hawaii Botany Department and the Hawaii Division of Aquatic Resources that demonstrate the impact of injection wells, and provide support for mitigative action.

I absolutely applaud those scientists who are willing to stand up for their data, and get involved in shaping public policy. Science often needs

translating, and we need to look to those who have carried out the studies for clarifications and assistance when applying their findings. In closing, the many human-induced threats that impact reefs are interconnected and will ALL need addressing in a concerted effort between community stakeholders and resource managers. Addressing the injection wells is one part of what should be a comprehensive strategy to reduce all types of local threats to our nearshore resources. We should always seek to employ the "precautionary principle," and base decisions upon a combination of sound science, relevant anecdotal data, and common sense erring on the side of caution.

Thank you for your consideration,
Liz Foote
Wailuku, Maui
(808) 669-9062
Lfoote

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: Berney Coleman <bcoleman48
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/28/2009 01:13 AM
Subject: Lahaina Injection Well permit renewal

Aloha Nancy,

Unlike most of the other folks who've probably written you regarding NOT renewing the Lahaina Injection Well permit, I think you should renew it given the conditions you've outlined.

I am concerned that the people against the injection well may have overlooked the real cause of reef degradation, etc.

If you look at the data, it shows that water reuse has more than doubled in the years from the mid 90's to around 2005. That's the very time our reefs have suffered the most – right? And where are we reusing the water? To irrigate surface plants on golf courses, midways and some resorts. These all are coincidentally, collocated with injection wells. I know this reclaimed irrigation water, mixed with regular water, runs right out in to the ocean – I can see it snorkeling at Kamaole Point, Cove Park and Ulua Beach. So my concern is that by increasing the reuse of waste water, we may be actually making the problem worse for our reefs. Especially if we use it to increase irrigation of resorts and golf courses along our precious beaches. I have seen no one question this before – have you?

So, I would support renewing the Lahaina Injection well.

Best Regards,

Berney Coleman
2191 S Kihei Rd #1309
Kihei, HI 96753
808-276-8910

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: ArnoldKotler
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 08/31/2009 10:33 PM
Subject: Lahaina, Maui Wastewater Treatment Plant

Ms. Nancy Rumrill
Environmental Protection Agency
Division of Environmental Protection
Bureau of Water Pollution Control

Dear Ms. Rumrill,

I am writing in regard to the Environmental Protection Agency's pending underground injection renewal permit for the Lahaina, Maui wastewater treatment plant. As a long-time resident of Maui, I support the DIRE Coalition and oppose the granting of a ten-year permit for the County to continue injecting these wastewaters. I urge the EPA to grant only the time necessary to upgrade treatment and develop the facilities to get the treated water to places where it can be safely and beneficially reused.

Thank you for your consideration.

Arnold Kotler
PO Box 790445
Paia, Maui, Hawai'i 96779

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Jeffrey H. Schwartz" <Jeff
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Cc: Brett Moffatt/R9/USEPA/US@EPA, allbright.david@epa.gov
Date: 09/20/2009 02:38 PM
Subject: DIRE Supplemental Comments on EPA Lahaina Injection Well Permit

Dear Nancy,

Attached find a set of supplemental comments that is being submitted to EPA Region 9 on behalf of the DIRE Coalition of Maui on the pending proposal of EPA to grant a 10-year permit for continued injection of wastewater at the Lahaina, Maui, wastewater treatment plant. In these comments, we specifically address the point raised in the August 20 hearing that EPA must have appropriate legal grounds to limit or restrict the Maui County's use of injection wells under the Safe Drinking Water Act. We ask that these comments be included in the record and considered at the time of decision on the permit application. We note that these comments are intended to supplement our earlier comments and testimony

and should not be construed in any way as retracting or limiting our earlier comments and testimony. We are submitting these comments on September 20, in light of the extension of the deadline for comments until September 21, 2009.

We appreciate your coming to Maui twice to hold hearings (and the August 20 public meeting) on this issue and hope that you will find these comments useful and on point with the concerns raised during those hearings.

We are pleased by the Mayor's visionary leadership in announcing the goal of ending all County wastewater injection on Maui and reusing 100% percent of the wastewater effluent after appropriate treatment. While we may disagree about the length of time it may take to turn this goal into a reality, we have no doubt that the community working together can achieve this result expeditiously and beneficially for the environment.

Now we are asking EPA to join us in this effort by utilizing the Agency's authorities (and carrying out its mandates) under the Safe Drinking Water Act, the Clean Water Act, EO 13089, and other appropriate provisions of law to limit any renewal of the permit at this point to no more than five years (considering the 15 years that have already been allowed in fact under the existing permit).

If it turns out that it is not feasible to accomplish the Mayor's goal within five years, the County may always apply for a further extension, and EPA may consider whether or not to grant it after seeing what progress has been achieved in three to three and a half years when good faith efforts have been made.

Again, we appreciate your consideration of these comments and the comments of individuals and groups throughout Maui who have written to you to urge your support of the DIRE Coalition's recommendations and presentations.

All the best,
Jeff Schwartz
for the DIRE Coalition
808-878-1314

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Robin Knox" <wqcinc
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA, undisclosed-recipients:
Date: 09/21/2009 11:50 PM
Subject: RE Robin Knox Comments on Lahaina Underground Injection Control Permit

Aloha Nancy –
Attached is a file entitled “ Robin Knox September 21 Comments on revised draft.doc” that contains my comments on the referenced draft permit. Please feel free to contact me with any questions.

Kindest regards,

Robin S. Knox
'(808) 281-6416

----- Forwarded by Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US on 11/06/2009 03:24 PM -----
From: "Robin Knox" <wqcin@epa.gov>
To: Nancy Rumrill/R9/USEPA/US@EPA
Date: 09/22/2009 09:47 AM
Subject: Attachment 1

Aloha Nancy – My comments submitted yesterday referred to an attachment that I neglected to attach. Here it is for your records. This is wastewater flow data provided to me by Scott Rollins, County of Maui.
Best regards –
Robin Knox